

NASSAU COUNTY  
BUS TRANSIT COMMITTEE

December 8, 2016

6:00 P.M.

BEFORE: SHELDON SHRENKEL, CHAIRMAN

1 A P P E A R A N C E S:

2 SHELTON SHRENKEL, CHAIRMAN

3 SAMUEL LITTMAN, ESQ.

4 LIVIO TONY ROSARIO

5 AARON WATKINS-LOPEZ

6 JACLENE D'AGOSTINO

7 JOEL BERSE

8 DAWN FALCO

9 JEAN DUROSEAU

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 MR. SHRENKEL: Good evening.

3 Welcome to the Nassau County Bus  
4 Transit Committee Meeting. This is our  
5 second session today to have public  
6 hearings. I'm Sheldon Shrenkel. I'm  
7 the chairman of the committee. I would  
8 like to introduce our members as part  
9 of a roll call.

10 To my far left, Mr. Aaron  
11 Watkins-Lopez, Mr. Joel Berse, Ms. Dawn  
12 Falco, Mr. Jean Duroseau, Mr. Tony  
13 Rosario, and counsel to our committee,  
14 Mr. Sam Littman.

15 First, we're going to hear a  
16 presentation today by the CEO of NICE  
17 Transportation, Mr. Michael Setzer.  
18 That will be followed by giving  
19 everybody an opportunity to voice your  
20 opinion and public comments. We have a  
21 court stenographer, so these records  
22 and these minutes are public.

23 What we ask that you do is kind of  
24 think about what you want to say,  
25 because the way these hearings are run,

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 we allow three minutes for your public  
3 comments. So we appreciate it if you  
4 don't go overtime and give everyone a  
5 chance.

6 So I would like to start the  
7 meeting. I would like to introduce the  
8 CEO of NICE Transportation, Mr. Michael  
9 Setzer.

10 MR. SETZER: Mr. Chairman,  
11 committee members, good evening. Thank  
12 you.

13 I would like to begin -- the  
14 agenda here is to talk a little bit  
15 about the funding situation that we  
16 face and to review with you what we can  
17 see today about the budget outlook for  
18 2017. We've got some recommendations  
19 to make which we will ask you to act  
20 on, but first you will get some  
21 additional comment from the public.

22 So let me start out with the  
23 funding situation that we face today,  
24 and here are our budget headlines from  
25 various media, and the point of this

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2           all is not the detail so much as the  
3           fact that we are not, Nassau County is  
4           not alone in being in this situation  
5           where we find ourselves.

6           Suffolk County was required to cut  
7           some of its bus service this year, and  
8           I believe it's considering some more  
9           cuts. Westchester County did some  
10          small cuts in April of this year.  
11          Outside of the metro area, it's  
12          happening all across the country, not  
13          in every place, but in many other  
14          places.

15          One example, probably the most  
16          surprising, is Washington, D.C., where  
17          this is the third largest transit  
18          system after New York and LA Metro,  
19          they have cut 14 bus routes completely  
20          already. They are currently developing  
21          a plan to cut a great deal of night  
22          train service and they're not finished  
23          yet.

24          The common thread among all of  
25          these systems, including Nassau County,

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2                   is that we are funded out of the  
3                   general fund, so transit service is  
4                   funded from the same source as public  
5                   health and public safety and public  
6                   education and other kinds of important  
7                   public priorities, and the result often  
8                   is that public transportation gets more  
9                   than -- more than its share of the  
10                  cuts.

11                 Some of these other things have a  
12                 very strong emergency nature to them.  
13                 They get taken care of first and public  
14                 transportation later, and when that  
15                 happens and there's no dedicated source  
16                 of funding that can't be spent on  
17                 anything else, what happens is exactly  
18                 what's happening in Nassau County.

19                 Before we do that, I just want to  
20                 go back a little bit, a little quick  
21                 history. This chart is one developed  
22                 by Nassau County Office of Management  
23                 Budget. What you see here is a  
24                 comparison of the performance of  
25                 NICE Bus versus the hypothetical

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2                   performance if you hadn't made the  
3                   change to NICE Bus. When I say NICE  
4                   Bus, I mean the partnership between  
5                   Nassau County and your operator,  
6                   Transdev.

7                   So in each of these four years,  
8                   the blue column represents the cost of  
9                   providing service through NICE Bus and  
10                  the orange column represents the  
11                  hypothetical cost if Long Island Bus  
12                  were still here and were operating with  
13                  the same kinds of costs that they  
14                  experience, and what the county used in  
15                  preparing this is the cost structure  
16                  that MTA Bus reports to the federal  
17                  government. So it's not our numbers,  
18                  their numbers.

19                 So in 2015, there's a 43 and a  
20                 half million dollar difference between  
21                 our cost and the hypothetical cost if  
22                 Long Island Bus were still here, so  
23                 \$43 million.

24                 If 2016 were completed and on this  
25                 chart, that would probably be a similar

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 number, and so over those five years,  
3 \$200 million in savings, but they're  
4 not really savings because the county  
5 didn't have that kind of money.

6 So if in 2015, the county had had  
7 another 43 and a half million dollars,  
8 then we would have provided a lot more  
9 service. Instead, that would have been  
10 a service cut equal to about 43 and a  
11 half million dollars because the county  
12 didn't have the money. That's why NICE  
13 Bus came here in the first place. The  
14 county didn't have the money to  
15 maintain that level of service.

16 So the difference between the blue  
17 column and the orange column, each one  
18 of those years is really service that's  
19 still on the street because of NICE Bus  
20 and because of the efforts of both  
21 Nassau County and Transit.

22 Here it is on a per hour basis.  
23 Those were annual figures. On a per  
24 hour basis, the blue column represents  
25 how much it cost for NICE Bus to put



1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2                   one hour of fixed route service on the  
3                   street, and the orange margin on top is  
4                   the additional cost if the county had  
5                   been able to afford it, which they  
6                   couldn't. So it really represents the  
7                   service cut that would have happened  
8                   already.

9                   We're going to have to talk about  
10                  service levels in just a few minutes  
11                  and we're going to have to have some  
12                  unpleasant possibilities that we  
13                  consider, but looking back, just keep  
14                  in mind it could have been a lot worse  
15                  a lot sooner.

16                 I also did a quick comparison here  
17                 with Westchester County, which is a  
18                 similar county with a private operator,  
19                 and here again you see it on a per hour  
20                 or per mile or per passenger basis,  
21                 however you would like to look at it.  
22                 NICE Bus is the most efficient operator  
23                 in the area even compared to other  
24                 private operators.

25                 So because of that efficiency,

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 because of the achievements of the  
3 partners here of the county and  
4 Transdev, these service losses have  
5 been held off for five years.

6 This map is a map that the MTA  
7 published in 2011 when they demanded  
8 additional money from the county which  
9 the county didn't have, and then said,  
10 well, if you don't have any additional  
11 money, then we're going to cut in their  
12 entirety all of those routes shown in  
13 red.

14 So as you can see, half of the  
15 service map would have disappeared five  
16 years ago except for the efforts of the  
17 county and Transdev together. That's a  
18 historical prospective. That's  
19 important to keep in mind even as we  
20 face some difficult choices going  
21 ahead.

22 So now I would like to talk about  
23 what we can reasonably foresee for next  
24 year. As you recall, we have a process  
25 here where our fiscal year begins

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2           January 1st, but we don't recommend a  
3           budget recommendation to the BTC until  
4           the middle of February, and the BTC  
5           doesn't act on it until near the end of  
6           March, and that's because some of the  
7           important inputs are not known  
8           immediately, not known at this time of  
9           the year. So ordinarily, we wait to  
10          see what we can learn about those  
11          things.

12                 This year, I think that it is  
13           important that we not wait until all  
14           the facts are known, but we begin to  
15           take some important steps, and I'll  
16           show you why.

17                 The first thing, and we look at  
18           this every year at the beginning of the  
19           budget process, is the balance budget  
20           mandate. In the contract between  
21           Transdev and the county and in the law  
22           that adopted it, we are required to  
23           adjust service levels to however many  
24           dollars the county has available.

25                 We do not have an alternative to

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 borrow, we do not have an alternative  
3 to kick the can down the road, to  
4 deficit finance in some way. We are  
5 obligated to adjust service level in  
6 however many dollars the county has  
7 available.

8 So standing here today, our best  
9 guess about what 2017 looks like is a  
10 \$12 million gap. That's a gap between  
11 the dollars that we reasonably  
12 anticipate the county having available  
13 and the dollars it would take to  
14 maintain exactly the same service as we  
15 operate today.

16 The components of that, I'll  
17 detail them a little bit more, but the  
18 components of that are about a  
19 \$5 million increase in operating  
20 expense, three and a half percent --  
21 and I'll show you why in a moment --  
22 and a \$7 million drop in revenues at  
23 five and a half percent.

24 So \$5 million increase in expense,  
25 \$7 million drop in revenues, there's

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   your \$12 million gap. It could fall  
3                   some more. I hope not. I don't expect  
4                   it to, but it's possible, and some  
5                   major unknown things remain today.

6                   So why are expenses going up  
7                   \$5 million? Well, the main reason is  
8                   that the cost of personnel rises each  
9                   year. We're anticipating that when our  
10                  current labor contract expires in April  
11                  of 2017, we will negotiate a new  
12                  agreement with TWU, who represents  
13                  about three-fourths of our employees,  
14                  and that that agreement will in the end  
15                  include some increases. We don't know  
16                  what it will be, we haven't begun to  
17                  negotiate yet, but we've made an  
18                  assumption here that it will include  
19                  increases.

20                 There are also some non-personnel  
21                 costs that will go up, for instance,  
22                 fuel, and there are some costs  
23                 associated with the service that we  
24                 reinstated mid-year this year.

25                 Do you remember at the beginning

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2           of 2016, we eliminated some routes?  
3           Then the county came up with some more  
4           funding and we reinstated those routes,  
5           some in the spring, some in June and  
6           some in September. If all that service  
7           were to operate for a full 12 months,  
8           it would take another million dollars,  
9           roughly.

10           Let me emphasize, we're seeing all  
11           nice round numbers, a million and a  
12           half, a million. This isn't a budget  
13           and we're not proposing a budget today.  
14           That happens in February, but we're  
15           trying to provide a pretty clear and  
16           simple picture of what the funding  
17           outlook looks like for next year.

18           The bigger challenge is on the  
19           revenue side, and so I want to go down  
20           these and share with you our  
21           assumptions about these and you can  
22           consider whether these are reasonable  
23           assumptions or not.

24           2016, New York State had the first  
25           line, \$66,657,800. That is the

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 biggest -- that's half of our operating  
3 budget as you probably recall, and our  
4 assumption is that there will be no  
5 increase for next year. Now, that  
6 could be wrong. It could actually go  
7 down too, although that's never  
8 happened before, but it could go up.

9 The reason that we think a zero  
10 increase assumption is the most  
11 reasonable today is, that's what  
12 happened this year. In 2015, it was  
13 exactly the same amount. So when the  
14 legislature developed -- the state  
15 legislature developed its budget, the  
16 downstate transit systems other than  
17 the MTA got exactly the same amount as  
18 we got in 2015.

19 So that's the best model I can  
20 think of for next year. Will the  
21 legislature do something different?  
22 Well, maybe. That's the basis of that  
23 assumption.

24 The line below it is the minimum  
25 Nassau County match to get that

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 66 million. So I'm fairly sure the  
3 county won't reduce that, but I'm also  
4 fairly sure that it won't go up either.

5 The county and Nassau Finance  
6 Authority have been bouncing a budget  
7 back and forth. NIFA has rejected it.  
8 NIFA has demanded deeper cuts Monday.  
9 The county put some additional cuts on  
10 the table which we'll get to in a  
11 minute.

12 So this is the floor. I don't see  
13 it can go any lower, but given NIFA's  
14 demands for a balanced budget, I also  
15 think it's highly unlikely it'll go any  
16 higher.

17 The third row, Nassau County  
18 share, that's the additional amount  
19 beyond the required local match that  
20 Nassau County provided this year, for  
21 2016, \$6.8 million dollars.

22 When Nassau County adopted a  
23 budget in October, it went down by  
24 \$3 million, and led this week in  
25 response to NIFA's rejection of the



1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 county budget, another 3.8 million was  
3 put on the table which I expect to  
4 stay.

5 So there's your \$6.8 million -- I  
6 called it \$7 million before --  
7 \$6.8 million reduction in local funds  
8 for 2017. The rest of the -- and those  
9 are the assumptions that go with those.

10 The rest of the things, let me  
11 just touch on quickly. The FTA grant,  
12 that's the federal grant, that's per a  
13 formula. It's unlikely to change.  
14 That's very predictable. The match  
15 from New York State and the match from  
16 Nassau County for that federal grant  
17 are minimal, so they're fairly  
18 predictable too. They can't really go  
19 any lower. The next line, passenger  
20 revenue, that could have some increase  
21 in it. For now, I'm showing zero  
22 increase.

23 The MTA, as you probably know, is  
24 currently holding public hearings and  
25 is currently considering increasing

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2                   MetroCard fares and cash fares on the  
3                   MTA, and we don't know what their  
4                   recommendation will be yet, but the two  
5                   alternatives that they are currently  
6                   considering are both fairly modest.  
7                   They, at best, would produce about a  
8                   million dollars, potentially  
9                   significantly less.

10                  So we can hope for some relief  
11                  here, but even if it's the full million  
12                  dollars, it's not enough to solve the  
13                  \$12 million problem.

14                  The last line is advertised at  
15                  700,000 miscellaneous revenue or  
16                  non-user revenue. That's mostly  
17                  advertising, bus advertising, and we've  
18                  got a contract for that. That's the  
19                  minimum the contractor must provide,  
20                  and even if the contractor does a lot  
21                  better, that's a relatively small  
22                  amount.

23                  So at the same time we're facing  
24                  some unknowns, more than we usually do.  
25                  At this time of year we're always

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 facing the unknown of STOA because that  
3 number's not known. There's no formula  
4 and it's not known until the state  
5 legislature finishes the budget  
6 process, which is typically the last  
7 day of March.

8 Again, as I've mentioned before,  
9 that could go up, could go down. Our  
10 most recent experience is flat. That's  
11 the working assumption for now until  
12 someone tells us otherwise. MTA fare  
13 changes, and we consider that all the  
14 time -- MTA fare changes, we consider  
15 every other year.

16 So those two unknowns are not  
17 unfamiliar to us collectively, but  
18 we also have a new collective  
19 bargaining agreement next year which  
20 will significantly affect our wage  
21 and benefits costs, and they haven't  
22 begun to negotiate. We have no basis  
23 for any particular assumption. We put  
24 an amount of money in there as a  
25 placeholder. I don't believe it will

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2           be zero. I do believe there will be an  
3           increase.

4           Lastly, the county does not have  
5           an approved budget yet. Typically, the  
6           county has an approved budget in  
7           October, but because of the NIFA  
8           intervention this year, the rejection  
9           of budgets, as of right now the county  
10          doesn't have an approved budget, so  
11          there's also some uncertainty there,  
12          although that's a relatively small  
13          amount.

14          So we look -- based on those  
15          assumptions, we think we're looking at  
16          a \$12 million gap for next year, and it  
17          may turn out to be 11 million or  
18          13 million. As I say, these are  
19          forecasts and they're not budget  
20          amounts and they're not precise at this  
21          point, but it's a bigger amount than we  
22          have ever looked at at this stage of  
23          the game before, at least in the five  
24          years I've been around. We've never  
25          had that size gap before, so that's why

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2           we're asking for you to consider some  
3           changes tonight.

4           There really are only three ways  
5           to balance the budget. You can  
6           increase revenues as we just discussed,  
7           and we'll try to do that and we'll  
8           continue to try to do that and we hope  
9           there is some relief there, but there  
10          are only so many places it can come  
11          from, the fare box, the county or the  
12          state. They're really -- there's no  
13          real potential for increases from the  
14          federal government.

15          Then, once we've done that, if  
16          that's not enough to close the gap,  
17          then we look at all non-service costs.  
18          We look at overhead costs. When we  
19          come to you with a budget in February,  
20          we will bring some significant  
21          reduction in overhead costs, then  
22          because I think we ought to look at our  
23          costs first before we do anything to  
24          the customers.

25          Lastly, if raising revenues and

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   cutting overhead costs doesn't close  
3                   the gap, then we have to look at  
4                   service, and that is what I predict we  
5                   will have to do this year.

6                   What I think makes the most sense  
7                   and is the most prudent is for the  
8                   elimination of some small routes in  
9                   January, and that's what we'll be  
10                  asking for you to approve later on this  
11                  evening, but I also want you to be --  
12                  to make that decision in the light of  
13                  what may have to be done later in the  
14                  year, probably in the budget or early  
15                  next year in the budget process in  
16                  February.

17                  We may be asking you to do -- to  
18                  approve some fare increases and to  
19                  consider some reductions in both fixed  
20                  route and Able-Ride service. It is  
21                  very distasteful to even talk about  
22                  those things, but it would also be  
23                  unrealistic to talk about those  
24                  possibilities as you consider these  
25                  January cuts.

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   One of the questions that always  
3 comes up why not wait until we know?  
4 Since there are so many uncertainties,  
5 why not wait until we know, and there  
6 have been years where we have done  
7 that, and it's close enough that we  
8 think we can get there even though we  
9 don't have all the facts yet. This  
10 year, with a \$12 million gap, I don't  
11 see any set of reasonable assumptions  
12 that would close that gap entirely  
13 accept using some service reductions.

14                  If we postpone those reductions  
15 until we know everything, then we  
16 wouldn't be able to get them in place.  
17 We would not know everything until  
18 April, and that means we -- there's a  
19 process to reducing service that's not  
20 instantaneous.

21                  So we couldn't do any service  
22 reductions until the middle of the  
23 year. We only have six months to get  
24 the savings that we got to cut twice as  
25 deep as if we cut the service at the

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2                   beginning of the year and get all 12  
3                   months worth of savings. So that's  
4                   part of our reason for doing some cuts  
5                   in January so we get the full benefit  
6                   of those cuts.

7                   These are the routes we recommend  
8                   for January elimination. Let me  
9                   explain the table a little bit. Most  
10                  of the -- except for the last two  
11                  lanes, these are the routes that were  
12                  eliminated at the beginning of 2016,  
13                  then restored during the year, some in  
14                  the spring, some in June, some in  
15                  September.

16                  So it is easy for someone to say,  
17                  well, this doesn't make any sense. You  
18                  cut them, you put them back, now you're  
19                  going to cut them again, and I  
20                  understand why that appears to be  
21                  irrational, but the reason that they're  
22                  on the list as the first routes to be  
23                  considered for cut is that they're the  
24                  poorest performing routes.

25                  They were eliminated at the



1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   beginning of the year because they were  
3                   poor performing routes then, meaning  
4                   low ridership, high tax subsidy. They  
5                   are even poorer today.

6                   When we restored them, all the  
7                   customers didn't come back as you would  
8                   expect because we forced them to do  
9                   something different. So as poor as  
10                  they were at the beginning of 2016,  
11                  they're even poorer at the beginning of  
12                  2017.

13                 The way to read this chart, if I  
14                 could take just a minute, if you read  
15                 across, the first one, Elmont FLEXI.  
16                 About a 150 passenger trips per day, so  
17                 that's probably 75 people taking round  
18                 trips or something close to that.

19                 So each of those 150 passenger  
20                 boarding means that the passenger puts  
21                 say 2.75 in the fare box and the tax  
22                 payers match that with \$24.72 each  
23                 time. So a 150 times a day, the tax  
24                 payers put \$24.72 in for those rides.

25                 Now, those rides are probably very

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   important to those people, but it's  
3                   also very -- it's a very significant  
4                   use of tax dollars, and one that I  
5                   don't think is sustainable. A 150  
6                   subsidies of \$24.72 a year if you do  
7                   the math is about \$3,600 per day.

8                   That's a lot of tax money that is  
9                   being used for a very small number of  
10                  people, vital to those people. I  
11                  don't doubt that for a minute, but it's  
12                  a lot of money for a small number of  
13                  people.

14                 Read down the list there. It gets  
15                 worse if you look Freeport Shuttle,  
16                 four lines down. \$36.84 to support the  
17                 ride, per wide to support 35 rides a  
18                 day. So that's 15 to 20 people who are  
19                 being subsidized at a very high rate.

20                 Again, I don't doubt that this is  
21                 crucial service for those people, but  
22                 it's also a very -- a very wasteful if  
23                 that's the right word or a very heavy  
24                 use of tax dollars for a very small  
25                 number of people.

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   So these routes are the ones we  
3                   recommend for elimination in January.  
4                   This page gets, out of that \$12 million  
5                   gap, we can get over \$2 million head  
6                   start on that gap by making these cuts  
7                   in January, so that will be our  
8                   recommendation.

9                   A lot less easy would be the April  
10                  cuts. If we still -- if we still got  
11                  no relief, no financial relief on the  
12                  revenue side, then in April, we would  
13                  be asking you to make -- in February,  
14                  we would be asking you to approve cuts  
15                  in April like the ones on this table.

16                  Don't take this as the absolute  
17                  final design, but something very much  
18                  like this where there are five routes,  
19                  five more routes eliminated entirely  
20                  and significant changes to many pretty  
21                  good performing routes.

22                  If you look under passengers per  
23                  day, you will see we're talking about  
24                  many significantly more riders than the  
25                  January routes, and if you looked at

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2           the subsidy per passenger column,  
3           they're not so demanding of the tax  
4           payers. Some of them are still taking  
5           a fairly significant subsidy for each  
6           passenger, but these are the next  
7           routes.

8           If we start with the routes based  
9           on their ridership and the amount of  
10          tax dollars they require, working up  
11          the list, these are the next ones on  
12          the list after the January routes.  
13          They are not -- they're not wasteful,  
14          they're not poor performing in the  
15          ordinary sense of the words. They're  
16          just the next ones that have to come  
17          up.

18          So it's very distasteful for  
19          everybody on the NICE Bus team to be  
20          recommending this at all. We don't  
21          want to do these things. These are  
22          harmful to people and to lots of  
23          people. You can see some fairly  
24          significant numbers of passengers on  
25          some of these if you go down towards

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 the bottom of the list there.

3 Significant numbers of people affected,  
4 but as I say, this is what's next if we  
5 don't get relief from some other  
6 quarter.

7 So here's a map showing those  
8 routes. The blue lines are the  
9 existing routes that would remain  
10 essentially as they are. The red lines  
11 are the routes that would either be  
12 eliminated or significantly impacted  
13 going from seven day a week service to  
14 five day a week service, going from all  
15 day service to peak hour only.

16 Significant changes that will have  
17 an impact on significant numbers of  
18 people. As you can see, it's a fairly  
19 expansive kind of cut, not as bad as  
20 that MTA map that I showed you at the  
21 beginning, but it's starting to look  
22 very serious.

23 If we also, at the time recommend  
24 sticking to the current Able-Ride  
25 policy, which is the federal

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2           requirement, which is any route or any  
3           bus -- any trip that originates and  
4           ends within three quarters of a mile of  
5           a fixed route bus stop must be provided  
6           on Able-Ride. If we stick to that,  
7           then there would also be erosion in the  
8           Able-Ride service.

9           Wherever you see kind of a bubble  
10          on this map, that's an area where  
11          Able-Ride eligibility would be  
12          affected. In some cases, it would be  
13          reduced, so they would like five days a  
14          week instead of weekends, in some cases  
15          eliminated altogether.

16          Smaller number of people here, but  
17          obviously a very significant impact.  
18          Many Able-Ride customers have very few  
19          or no alternatives to access medical  
20          care, jobs and those kinds of things.

21          So I don't make this -- I don't  
22          put this up here lightly, but I think  
23          it has to be on the table for your  
24          consideration. You don't have to  
25          decide today, but you might have to

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2           deal with this come February.

3           So our recommendation, just to  
4           reiterate, is to eliminate those nine  
5           routes in January, and then to do that  
6           in light of the potential need to take  
7           some even more distasteful and more  
8           difficult steps two months from now in  
9           February as we begin the budget  
10          process.

11          We also ask that the minutes of  
12          the meeting that you have receive  
13          public comments both in writing, which  
14          you have in front of you and in person  
15          as you'll here in a minute, and that  
16          you've also received the Title 6  
17          analysis that's required by the federal  
18          government.

19          So with that, Mr. Chairman and the  
20          committee, I'm finished with my  
21          presentation. I'm prepared to answer  
22          your questions now or later on and  
23          receive any comments.

24          MR. SHRENKEL: Of course, this is  
25          our second public hearing, Mr. Setzer,

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 you know, that I raised several  
3 comments before. Can you hear me?

4 MR. SETZER: Yes.

5 MR. SHRENKEL: Thank you. We did  
6 raise, you know, many comments with you  
7 in the first meeting which, again, are  
8 part of a public record, so I'm not  
9 going to comment any further to the  
10 questions that I asked you.

11 Of course, committee members are  
12 welcome to ask Mr. Setzer any other  
13 questions one of which they may have  
14 forgotten.

15 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: What's the  
16 possibility because the three-quarters  
17 of a mile rule is the bare minimum?

18 MR. SETZER: That's correct.

19 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: So what's the  
20 possibility of expanding Able-Ride  
21 service past that if we do have to come  
22 back in two months and cut the rest of  
23 these routes?

24 MR. SETZER: That is entirely at  
25 the county's discretion. It's a matter



1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 of resources. There's no rule that  
3 prevents us from offering more than the  
4 federal minimum. You're correct.

5 MR. SHRENKEL: Mr. Berse.

6 MR. BERSE: I question some of the  
7 things that happened last year. When  
8 we cut the service -- it takes three  
9 weeks as a scientific fact for people  
10 to develop a new habit, and when the  
11 money was restored and service was  
12 restored, the people had already  
13 developed a new habit not to take those  
14 routes.

15 I questioned the sufficiency in  
16 publicizing about what returned and how  
17 it returned because in many cases, I  
18 met people not even knowing that I sit  
19 on this committee saying they didn't  
20 know what happened with the buses, and  
21 they didn't know that service is back  
22 that they lost.

23 So I don't know that the cuts and  
24 then the restoration is a fair  
25 assessment now, that maybe in the 11th

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 hour, money will come once again, and  
3 that was -- was enough done for people  
4 to be informed?

5 The first route you have there is  
6 the Elmont FLEXI. I also looked at  
7 that community, and one of the places  
8 that the county has cut services to  
9 them, first, when the consolidation of  
10 the police stations were done, they  
11 were affected, the buses were done,  
12 they were affected.

13 You know, I would wonder if  
14 they're going to want to defect from  
15 the county the way they've been  
16 treated, and it's just a certain, and  
17 it goes to Freeport also.

18 I just I'm uncomfortable seeing  
19 this stuff happening or crying wolf a  
20 little bit. I mean I know there's a  
21 problem. Last year, we looked at  
22 everything. It was a real business  
23 decision, but given what happened, that  
24 the money was found to do the  
25 restoration, I question this year as a

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 repeater.

3 So I don't know how you feel.

4 Those are just more comments than

5 questions, but, you know, I don't know

6 how you would want to respond or if you

7 even want to respond to that.

8 MR. SETZER: Actually, I would

9 want to, Mr. Berse. I share your

10 frustration in a lot of ways.

11 The Elmont FLEXI has been

12 successful in operational terms. It's

13 working well. It was an experiment to

14 see if we can do that and we can, and

15 the few people who are using it like it

16 a lot. I think if it were left alone

17 for a while, more people would find

18 their way to it.

19 So it's very disappointing to us

20 to have to discuss this. The

21 alternatives -- this is a zero sum

22 game. If we don't take it there, then

23 we'll take it someplace else. You as a

24 committee, of course, have that

25 discretion, but our recommendation is

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   that this is the least bad of a bunch  
3                   of bad alternatives.

4                   If there's a better alternative  
5                   that I know of, I would certainly put  
6                   it on the table, but your point is well  
7                   taken here. It's not -- it might do  
8                   better if it were more sustainable, but  
9                   unfortunately, it's not sustainable.

10                  MR. BERSE: Part of what I had  
11                  spoken about last year was that the  
12                  service in Nassau County is vital to  
13                  residents of Nassau County and tax  
14                  payers of Nassau County, and a lot of  
15                  them do commute into the city.

16                  Maybe we should question about  
17                  crossing over the Suffolk border and  
18                  maybe cutting like you cut the one  
19                  route that was in East Meadow down to  
20                  size. That maybe reducing routes or  
21                  combining schedules for drivers or what  
22                  you talked about, the articulated buses  
23                  or the busy runs, we should start to  
24                  look for savings in ways that can restore  
25                  funds into the whole general picture.

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 MR. SETZER: Certainly. I don't  
3 disagree with that at all. You  
4 mentioned one thing by the way the  
5 articulated buses are being  
6 manufactured right now. As a matter of  
7 fact, we, in the plant, accepted the  
8 first one today.

9 So they'll be delivered in the  
10 next few months and put into service on  
11 the very heavy lines where we're  
12 passing up people. We're looking for  
13 anything we can where we can be more  
14 efficient.

15 So the service cuts that we've  
16 proposed here, even all the ones in  
17 April together don't reach 12 million.  
18 This is part of a larger approach to  
19 solve that \$12 million gap, that some  
20 additional revenue from someplace and  
21 some more savings other than service,  
22 but it always comes in. You still got  
23 to find 12 million someplace.

24 MR. BERSE: Well, the officials in  
25 office have to find that and give it to

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   us so we do not have to do this. You  
3                   know, that's not in our power to find  
4                   the money.

5                   It's in our power to say yes, you  
6                   can and no, you can't, but I'm  
7                   personally unhappy with this whole  
8                   thought process, and I'll just leave it  
9                   there. I don't want to make this go  
10                  back and forth. I don't think that's  
11                  fair to everyone else.

12                 MR. SETZER: I share your  
13                 unhappiness, Mr. Berse. I don't think  
14                 anyone in the chambers here is pleased  
15                 with this.

16                 MS. FALCO: Good evening,  
17                 Mr. Setzer.

18                 MR. SETZER: Good evening.

19                 MS. FALCO: I think that the  
20                 ultimate fear is how can we ensure the  
21                 restoration of ridership when we have  
22                 these routes that are taken away, and  
23                 then alternate methods of transportation  
24                 have to be obtained by the riders, and  
25                 then they're re-implemented into

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 service and try to go and get these  
3 people back, get ridership back and  
4 then pull it again.

5 I just feel like the back and  
6 forth cat and mouse for them will  
7 result in them finding permanent  
8 alternative means of transportation,  
9 and that's a big concern for us because  
10 we do want to maintain ridership, of  
11 course, in terms of dollars, and the  
12 bottom line is the dollars that are at  
13 issue.

14 So that's just a comment that I  
15 have. Thank you.

16 MR. SETZER: Ms. Falco, I think  
17 you're exactly right. I've said this  
18 before. This is the worst possible way  
19 to do it. There are needs, and I'm  
20 sure you're going to hear from some  
21 members of the public in a moment.  
22 There are needs that are not being met  
23 now.

24 At the earlier hearing, we had  
25 people from Port Washington who

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 identified a new need and it's  
3 legitimate, and I wish we were meeting  
4 to talk about the new service we were  
5 putting in there.

6 There are also the people who are  
7 going to be -- going to lose service,  
8 and one other group that's not even  
9 being mentioned here that has real  
10 needs, and that -- these are the big  
11 routes that are so crowded that we can't  
12 pick everybody up. They sometimes have  
13 to wait for a second or third bus.

14 These are all resource issues.  
15 We're trying to find the least bad of a  
16 bunch of bad alternatives.

17 MS. FALCO: I understand. Thank  
18 you.

19 MR. SHRENKEL: Any other comments  
20 for Mr. Setzer?

21 MR. DUROSEAU: Mr. Setzer, I'm  
22 looking right now at the first route,  
23 the Elmont FLEXI, and you say you guys  
24 been doing 150 passengers per day.  
25 Let's say 75 back and forth maybe, and



1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 you also stated that for each one of  
3 those passenger, the tax payer pay  
4 \$24.72 cents.

5 MR. SETZER: That's correct.

6 MR. DUROSEAU: Is that right?

7 MR. SETZER: Yeah, that's right,  
8 Mr. Duroseau.

9 MR. DUROSEAU: Okay, I understand  
10 that very much, but also I believe that  
11 was a Legislator or Congressman who was  
12 in the crowd earlier, I forgot her  
13 name.

14 MR. SHRENKEL: Legislator Curran.

15 MR. DUROSEAU: She also mentioned  
16 there is \$12 million somewhere. Okay,  
17 why don't we start -- why don't, you  
18 know, get to those legislators, get to  
19 those Congressmen and see where --  
20 we're sitting on that money, but we  
21 don't think it's right. I mean I don't  
22 think it's right.

23 So we can wait a little bit. I  
24 don't mind paying the \$24.72 cents  
25 because doing that, you save yourself.

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 I don't want to do that to those  
3 people. It's harmful.

4 MR. SETZER: Right.

5 MR. DUROSEAU: And me too, I don't  
6 want to do that to those people. It's  
7 harmful. So can you please look a  
8 little bit harder, see what you can do?

9 MR. SETZER: Mr. Duroseau, we're  
10 in regular contact with both state and  
11 county officials making sure that this  
12 deficit is understood.

13 Today, the county approved budget  
14 is 123 million for next year. It's a  
15 130 million for this year. The  
16 \$6.8 million revenue loss is real, and  
17 I hope that they step forward and  
18 correct it or improve it. I think that  
19 there is a potential that there will be  
20 some additional revenue found. That's  
21 why we're not trying to solve -- we're  
22 not trying to cut all 12 million out of  
23 the service.

24 We're still hoping that there are  
25 other savings and some additional

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 revenue that come available. That's  
3 why doing a little bit in January and  
4 pushing the rest out to April gives  
5 everybody time to do some more if they  
6 possibly can.

7 I still think that it's most  
8 prudent to take those small routes  
9 right away in January and get the full  
10 2 plus million dollars in savings, but  
11 I understand your point, and I can't  
12 foresee the future any better than  
13 anybody else can.

14 MR. DUROSEAU: I also understand.

15 MR. SHRENKEL: Mr. Setzer, thank  
16 you.

17 MR. SETZER: Thank you.

18 MR. BERSE: Mr. Setzer, if I might  
19 ask one more question. Just something  
20 for an example, as I was looking at the  
21 list by my esteemed colleague speaking  
22 to you a minute ago, if you look at the  
23 N6X, is that planned that when the  
24 college is on recess that there is no  
25 bus service there, that that might be a

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 way to save?

3 MR. SETZER: If we take the N6X  
4 out there, there will still be plenty  
5 of service between Hempstead Transit  
6 Center and the college, just that  
7 little express that we put in to try to  
8 improve things, that would go away.

9 MR. BERSE: But what I'm thinking  
10 is when the school is not in session,  
11 is it already taken away or is it --

12 MR. SETZER: Yes. That's what we  
13 do now.

14 MR. BERSE: So then somebody has  
15 already thought of that. Thank you.

16 MR. SHRENKEL: At this time, we  
17 would like to invite you to state your  
18 comments.

19 MR. SOLAGES: Thank you. Good  
20 evening to the committee, good evening  
21 to the Chairman. Thank you for having  
22 us at this time so that everyday people  
23 can attend this hearing at this time.

24 I represent the 3rd Legislative  
25 District, which includes Elmont, Valley

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   Stream, South Floral Park Inwood, North  
3                   Woodmere, and my district is affected  
4                   by these cuts, specifically the FLEXI  
5                   route that was recently established, I  
6                   think, October of this year.

7                   I'm sure the pamphlets for the  
8                   brochures for that bus line are not --  
9                   the ink on it is not even dry, and here  
10                  we are now talking about cutting these  
11                  lines. Like the two members of the  
12                  committee said before previously, it  
13                  does not make sense, and as Mr. Setzer  
14                  said, it's almost insane.

15                 You know, we have to stop, pause,  
16                 and excuse me for having my back  
17                 towards you, but -- and ask ourselves  
18                 as a county, which is the most heavily  
19                 taxed county in the country, why are  
20                 we talking about cutting essential  
21                 services like bus services? Why do  
22                 these conversations and these cuts  
23                 always occur at the time when it's  
24                 getting colder.

25                 These are serious questions that

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   we must consider, and I'm asking this  
3                   committee to please think outside the  
4                   box and not resort to these draconian  
5                   harsh cuts being recommended, and that  
6                   the county budget situation is an ever  
7                   evolving issue that may change  
8                   tomorrow, and making such  
9                   recommendations for cuts today might  
10                  have long term effects.

11                  I submit to you as a legislator,  
12                  of course being in the political  
13                  minority here in Nassau County, but  
14                  also having relationships with state  
15                  officials such as Assemblywoman  
16                  Michaëlle Solages, Senator Todd  
17                  Kaminsky, that we will reach out to our  
18                  state officials and ask for more state  
19                  funding. It is only right.

20                  In addition, we will do our part  
21                  in asking in the county budget process  
22                  that we not cut essential services.

23                  Just today, we have written a  
24                  letter, the Democratic caucus, I had  
25                  written a letter to the governor asking

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 him to sign a bill that's on his table  
3 that's already been approved by the  
4 assembly and the Senate, asking that  
5 funding for legal aid not anymore be  
6 born by the counties and by the state.  
7 That would free up money.

8 There are uncollected money at the  
9 county jail that we have not tapped  
10 into, at least half a million dollars.  
11 We have other suggestions to build  
12 revenue.

13 In fact, when the announcement for  
14 the cut for the N2 and the other bus  
15 lines in Elmont was originally  
16 announced last year, I made the  
17 recommendation to the county executive  
18 to put a surcharge on Uber service here  
19 or put a surcharge on Airbnb service  
20 here. Other ways to drive up revenue  
21 that would not put a cost on people  
22 like a tax.

23 Unfortunately, due to the lack of  
24 true bipartisan work here in our  
25 county, we have not seen many valid

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2           recommendations being made by the  
3           political minority being considered by  
4           the majority and by the county  
5           executive.

6           That's why I'm asking many people  
7           tonight to continue to press the county  
8           executive to do the right thing and to  
9           find \$12 million. That's possible.

10          You know, as a member of the Rules  
11          Committee, I sit on the committee that  
12          considers contracts for law firms and  
13          other outside venders, millions and  
14          millions of dollars, and I've  
15          personally, in the last week, have  
16          voted against contracts to law firms  
17          over \$12 million.

18          Unfortunately, because we only  
19          have three votes, those contracts are  
20          passed, and also with the lack of an  
21          independent inspector general here in  
22          Nassau County, much money and much  
23          funding and revenue is being wasted.  
24          We need time to really come together as  
25          one county government.



1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   I understand your remark,  
3                   Mr. Berse, before about Elmont  
4                   succeeding, but we love this county and  
5                   we love this country, and we would  
6                   never succeed. I think I can say that  
7                   on behalf of my residents.

8                   Yes, we've seen our precincts  
9                   close and yes we've seen our bus lines  
10                  cut, but we're going to continue to  
11                  fight for the best interests of county  
12                  residents and make sure that we can see  
13                  a day in Nassau that an everyday  
14                  working person has a chance to survive  
15                  here.

16                  I went to Bloomingdale's the other  
17                  night to buy a gift for my loved one.  
18                  The cashier was a 54-year-old white  
19                  male, and he thanked me for helping to  
20                  restore the bus service in Elmont.

21                  Times are tough now. Just because  
22                  you go to Roosevelt Field and Green  
23                  Acres Mall and you see a lot of people  
24                  shopping there, don't think that times  
25                  are great and things are great. People

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 are still suffering.

3 For the everyday family in Nassau  
4 County, you're living below poverty  
5 level. That means that everyday people  
6 use these bus lines, and I have sent  
7 many letters to Mr. Setzer criticizing  
8 the bus company for not properly  
9 publicizing the new service they have  
10 in Elmont.

11 People are not going to stand in  
12 the cold being concerned whether or not  
13 a bus is going to come. They're just  
14 not going to show up in the first place.  
15 You have to give that line a chance to  
16 succeed. How can you say you're giving  
17 that line a chance to succeed if you're  
18 cutting it already? It doesn't make  
19 sense. You buy cheap, you buy twice.

20 I'm asking this committee to  
21 please not engage in making such harsh  
22 cuts, to perhaps look at the totality  
23 of the circumstances. Join us in our  
24 letters and in our statements to county  
25 executive to ask him to change his

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2                   priorities, to not benefit these  
3                   politically connected firms, and instead  
4                   spend the money where it's needed such  
5                   as in a public transportation system.

6                   I thank you for this time and this  
7                   opportunity to speak, but I ask  
8                   everyone to please continue to advocate  
9                   for the right thing here in Nassau  
10                  County. Thank you very much.

11                  MR. SHRENKEL: At this time,  
12                  anyone who would like to address the  
13                  committee, what I would like you to do  
14                  however is you come up to the podium  
15                  please state your name, town you live  
16                  in, if you're representing yourself or  
17                  you're representing an organization,  
18                  let us know.

19                  Think about what you want to say,  
20                  and please understand you have three  
21                  minutes, and if you see my hand go like  
22                  that, it means please wrap it up, and  
23                  if you don't wrap it up, I'm just going  
24                  to say thank you.

25                  Sir, in the back.

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 MR. ALBERT: I'm Mark Albert. I  
3 think the budget cut should not be cut.  
4 I think Old Bethpage should still stay  
5 on. That's where I live. I hope the  
6 buses don't -- Able-Ride don't bus cut.  
7 I took NICE Bus for a long time, so I  
8 please would like you to think about  
9 it. Thank you.

10 MR. SHRENKEL: Young lady, yes.

11 MS. LOWTHER: As a concerned  
12 person with a developmental disability  
13 and also as an advocate for people with  
14 disabilities, I use both Able and the  
15 public buses.

16 By taking away both of these  
17 services, you're leaving people with  
18 disabilities no way to get around, and  
19 I'm concerned because I take it to go  
20 shopping. I don't get other revenue  
21 from the county if you don't have the  
22 busses or Able-Ride. Thank you.

23 Before my mom died years ago,  
24 since age of 18, I learned how to take  
25 buses, and I'm 48 and I love using

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 public transportation because it's  
3 great for me instead of depending on  
4 other people.

5 MS. LAWSON: I'm from Williston  
6 Park. I need these services for work  
7 and medical appointments, and I don't  
8 think it's fair to keep cutting the  
9 buses because I like using them. Thank  
10 you very much.

11 MR. MENDEL: Hi. My name is David  
12 Mendel. I don't represent anybody, but  
13 I'm trying to help people so everybody  
14 thinks what I a great guy I am, and I  
15 have some ideas that I mentioned  
16 before, and I'm going to try to be  
17 polite, but the mic doesn't seem to  
18 work. I won't curse or anything.

19 Here's the bottom line. What you  
20 need to do is make believe that you're  
21 on these buses, you people. You need  
22 to find empathy. There is so much  
23 sympathy out there, it's disgusting.  
24 You need to put yourself in these poor  
25 peoples places that work 13 hours a days

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2           for \$9 an hour, sit at bus stops for 3  
3           hours to go from Massapequa to  
4           Hicksville. It's disgusting.

5           As I said before, you built a  
6           bicycle path, a bicycle path, a bicycle  
7           path from Seaford to Tobay Beach for  
8           millions upon millions of dollars  
9           that's falling apart.

10          You can go to Ed Mangano's -- and  
11          I got nothing personal against Ed --  
12          you can go to Ed Mangano's holiday  
13          party tonight. I don't know if you  
14          paid for the 4th of the July thing at  
15          the beach, but I know you fixed up the  
16          park with miniature golf courses.  
17          This, that, the other thing.

18          You do whatever you got to do to  
19          help these poor mostly black, Hispanic  
20          people that sit for hours upon hours to  
21          help you run your lives and your  
22          business, and look, you know why the  
23          place is empty -- not a joke -- because  
24          they can't get here by bus or they're  
25          too busy working.

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   How dare you treat these people  
3                   like this. Isn't your greed bad  
4                   enough? Find the money. It's there.  
5                   I gave you suggestions before how to  
6                   raise money. Put better advertising on  
7                   the buses, make deals with people. The  
8                   Hispanic people will come to you a  
9                   million times over, but enough is  
10                  enough. Like I been fighting the  
11                  7-Eleven to donate their food, eight to  
12                  ten thousand sandwiches and salad goes  
13                  in the garbage every day.

14                 Enough with you people. I beg of  
15                 you make believe it's your life on the  
16                 line, and ask your friends, whoever you  
17                 know with all route 6X, route this.  
18                 It's all a bunch of crap.

19                 Find the right people to sit down  
20                 like it's your life and engineer  
21                 something. Have engineers to map out  
22                 everything, come up with a system,  
23                 because truthfully if whatever position  
24                 you wanted in political life, if you  
25                 knew that you got that political

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   position for as long as you wanted as  
3                   long as you took care of this, you  
4                   would work your butt off night and day.

5                   Look at these poor people, and I  
6                   said it before, you stand on a corner,  
7                   take a bus for two days, two days in  
8                   the rain where you got to transfer,  
9                   okay, and see these old, poor people  
10                  sitting there freezing cold. When is  
11                  the bus coming? Nobody ever has a  
12                  clue. It's simple.

13                  Another thing is this, if you do  
14                  the right thing finally and put more  
15                  and more buses on, the people will not  
16                  only use them, they will work longer  
17                  hours, be able to support their  
18                  families and not spend six hours a day  
19                  on a bus, and you know what, most of  
20                  them got two jobs, and I apologize to  
21                  you, and I am not violent. I implore  
22                  violence, but I will tell you one last  
23                  thing, they spoke about the bus company  
24                  maybe striking.

25                  My opinion, I'm going to try



1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2                   organize a strike where all these  
3                   people who work for peanuts that you  
4                   all count on for your -- this, that,  
5                   busboys, whatever it might be, that  
6                   they go on strike, okay, and let you  
7                   see what it's like without them.

8                   Again, I wish you all nothing but  
9                   greatness and happiness in your life,  
10                  and the truth is, I'm also doing this  
11                  because there's a certain person. I  
12                  don't want you to think of me as just a  
13                  homeless loser. Thank you again. I  
14                  wish you all goodness, and you need  
15                  more people here. Thank you.

16                  MS. QUIRK: Hi. My name is  
17                  Christine Quirk. I think it's a little  
18                  bit un-fair that they're cutting  
19                  Able-Ride. I need to keep Able-Ride as  
20                  much as I can because I need to go to  
21                  family and I need to keep my  
22                  appointments, and I don't think it's  
23                  really fair what they're doing. That's  
24                  it.

25                  MR. SHRENKEL: Thank you.

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 MS. SILBERGER: Hi. My name is  
3 Sylvia Silberger. I'm here as a  
4 concerned citizen.

5 First, I would like to express my  
6 frustration at the futility of this  
7 exercise, that somehow these public  
8 hearings are removed from the people  
9 with the purse strings. So Mr. Setzer,  
10 in all due respect, has no choice but  
11 to cut something, and you have no  
12 choice but to listen to all these  
13 people who are losing their lives and  
14 losing their livelihood.

15 For the record, I will say, first,  
16 I am disappointed and frustrated by the  
17 way Nassau County has organized these  
18 events. I am horrified when I look at  
19 the first round of cuts and see one bus  
20 has more than 500 riders a day. That's  
21 500 people. That's a lot of people who  
22 are losing a livelihood.

23 Then you look at the second round  
24 a day. I think I saw some with 1800  
25 riders, and some of these riders --

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   some of these bus riders end up missing  
3                   buses because they're full. They need  
4                   these buses. They spend hours  
5                   commuting.

6                   For a service for those who need  
7                   it, it is so important, it is so  
8                   humane, it is so rational. But I would  
9                   also like to speak to the broader issue  
10                  that we need to encourage more people  
11                  to be riding buses, not fewer people.

12                  Right now, the only people riding  
13                  buses are the ones that absolutely need  
14                  to ride the bus because they're  
15                  unreliable. They end up breaking a lot  
16                  of time and they end up spending a lot  
17                  of time on the buses.

18                  I was listening to NPR this  
19                  morning and Paris is have having a  
20                  state of emergency with their air  
21                  quality. Congestion is outrageous on  
22                  Long Island. We're losing young people  
23                  who don't want to have to rely on a  
24                  car.

25                  We need to find a way to make

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 better, more reliable public  
3 transportation, not just continually  
4 cut it, and I know you guys don't have  
5 the purse strings, so I'm just going to  
6 say that to put on the record. That's  
7 it. Thank you.

8 MR. SHRENKEL: Thank you very  
9 much.

10 MR. MCALISTER: Hello. I'm Larry  
11 McAlister. I don't like to cut the  
12 NICE Bus route from -- I want to  
13 continue -- I would love to continue to  
14 take -- still take the NICE Bus to  
15 program five days a week. I don't want  
16 any cuts, okay? I want them to stay.  
17 I don't want any cuts. I don't like  
18 getting home late either, okay? That's  
19 all.

20 MR. SHRENKEL: Someone else in the  
21 back had their hand up.

22 MS. DAVIS: Hi. My name is Amanda  
23 Davis. I live in Roslyn, but I work in  
24 Hempstead. I'm actually a disability  
25 rights attorney down there.

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   Basically, my concern is that this  
3 is the 13th wealthiest county in the  
4 country, yet we're struggling to  
5 provide the basics for people with  
6 disabilities.

7                   Just to give everyone an idea, the  
8 disabled communities has the lowest  
9 rates of employment and the highest  
10 rates -- sorry -- of poverty. In terms  
11 of using the NICE Bus, I actually  
12 utilize the N23 to get to my second bus  
13 to get to Hempstead. I wait in all  
14 kinds of conditions. I have multiple  
15 health conditions, but I don't qualify  
16 for Able-Ride. I have waited in 100  
17 degree heat, and this winter, I will,  
18 with my service dog, walk across roads  
19 in snow and in the cold.

20                  When you talk about eliminating  
21 service to once an hour, you're  
22 actually harming many, many people. On  
23 the N23 line, there are predominantly  
24 elderly people who live in Port  
25 Washington who have no access to any

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   other area. This is one of the sole  
3                   north to south lines, and it actually  
4                   connects to the N21, the N20H, the N27,  
5                   the N22, the N22X and the N24.

6                   If you cut that, the people will  
7                   be waiting hours because they have to  
8                   take two to three buses to get from  
9                   point A to point B. My commute by car  
10                  is 15 minutes. My commute by bus in  
11                  the morning is over an hour, and in the  
12                  evening, an hour and a half. It makes  
13                  it impossible for me to have any life  
14                  outside of it, but more importantly, it  
15                  is the sole feasible way for me to  
16                  reach my work, my place of employment.

17                  In the blind community,  
18                  unemployment is 76 percent, and one of  
19                  the big factors is a lack of  
20                  transportation and a lack of accessible  
21                  transportation. I live within the  
22                  three-quarter mile rule. They don't  
23                  take into consideration the conditions  
24                  and the weather. So that means I  
25                  either take days off.

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   If you talk about waiting an hour  
3                   in between buses, if you miss one, say  
4                   I miss my N21 or N40, I waited in  
5                   Mineola for an hour in the cold or in  
6                   the heat which is also dangerous for my  
7                   dog. Imagine you're a 75-year-old  
8                   woman or you're a person who works two  
9                   jobs and has 3 children at home. This  
10                  will be infeasible for them. I  
11                  understand that you -- someone said you  
12                  don't control the purse strings, but I  
13                  hope that you can take this message  
14                  back to those who do, and to the state  
15                  and the county and the federal  
16                  government and explain how this hurts  
17                  people.

18                  Many of my clients utilize  
19                  Able-Ride to reach their doctors and  
20                  their day programs as well as social  
21                  activities. This is their lifeline.  
22                  If this is cut, if the N23, which is  
23                  1800 people is cut, buses will become  
24                  inaccessible to those with  
25                  disabilities.

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 There have been times where people  
3 have had to wait because there are only  
4 two wheelchairs spots and three  
5 wheelchairs. There have been days  
6 where my dog and I have been forced on  
7 the N4 and N41 line to wait for the  
8 next bus in inclement weather. This is  
9 not acceptable. It is not livable.

10 Again, we are the 13th wealthiest  
11 county in the country. We need to find  
12 a way to fund it. I understand and I  
13 do empathize with the CEO of NICE Bus.  
14 I really do. You have to put yourself  
15 in the position of those of us who  
16 don't use it as a preference, but as a  
17 necessity. Thank you.

18 MR. SHRENKEL: One other comment.  
19 Richard.

20 MR. CULLERY: Hi. I'm Richard  
21 Cullery. I'm representing the Bus  
22 Riders Union and any decent people out  
23 there.

24 To the members of the TAC, before  
25 I begin my plea before you people, I



1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 wish to tell you that I'm not blind to  
3 or deaf to the shortcomings of Nassau  
4 County Legislature, and yet year after  
5 year, you decide to put brunt of this  
6 fact on the horse shoulders of those  
7 who depend directly or indirectly on  
8 the bus system.

9 You do this by either approving  
10 fare hikes which causes people to pay  
11 more for less or you cut routes which  
12 causes people to go out of their way to  
13 find alternatives just to get around  
14 with the increased potential of losing  
15 their jobs or to not be able to go to  
16 college. These people have to find  
17 other places that do have alternatives  
18 means of transportation. These will be  
19 the lucky ones.

20 For the unlucky ones like senior  
21 citizens who can no longer drive and  
22 the disabled, they will be homebound at  
23 worst or so dependent on other people  
24 to get them to and from places they  
25 need to be, condemning them to a nursing

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   home.

3                   Because those lines and Able-Ride  
4                   won't have a reason to service the area,  
5                   when there are no bus lines leaving  
6                   those used to depend on Able-Ride  
7                   stranded in their own homes with no  
8                   recourse to pursue to get around.

9                   Oh, and by the way, I am not  
10                  against car drivers. Matter of fact, I  
11                  love those who respect the road, and  
12                  especially those who do not hit me  
13                  while I travel on my bike, which I like  
14                  to whenever I travel to work or to  
15                  other places that are reasonably close by  
16                  for me to travel to like movie theaters  
17                  or the Nassau Mall, you know, Nassau  
18                  Metroplex 10.

19                 However, it can't take me to all  
20                 the places I want to go on the Long  
21                 Island, so I'm going to let you guys in  
22                 on a secret. I am studying right now  
23                 for my permit test so I can learn how  
24                 to drive a car one day.

25                 So why am I speaking? It is

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 because I speak for those who can't  
3 learn to drive because they are too old,  
4 or too disabled and have no recourse to  
5 get around without assistance.

6 Oh, and by the way, do you know  
7 what eats up a lot of the county's  
8 money year after year? It's your  
9 repairing the roads that a ton of cars  
10 use every day.

11 People complain about the cost to  
12 repairing the roads and complain about  
13 balancing the budget, but one of the  
14 most surefire ways to reduce the cost  
15 of repairing the roads is to make good  
16 investments in alternative  
17 transportation and getting back to  
18 start running the buses right and not  
19 cutting lines, and the county can  
20 balance the books, but I got a feeling  
21 that you won't care. Why not? Because  
22 you guys get to go drive home in your  
23 nice cars and not worry about the  
24 little guy.

25 You want to prove me wrong, then

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 for once in your lives, get NICE to act  
3 responsibly by rejecting the request  
4 for either fare increases or line cuts.  
5 Listen to the hard reason and all the  
6 people who depend on services every  
7 day. Thank you.

8 MR. SOLAGES: Thank you again for  
9 allowing me just to speak again. I  
10 know I spoke before. I have another  
11 comment that I neglected to make.

12 You know, before when it was  
13 publicly announced that the FLEXI ride  
14 was to be revealed in Elmont, I made a  
15 comment to the media stating that.  
16 There has to be -- and I implore this  
17 body to make a recommendation. There  
18 has to be a body or a person or an  
19 office that is responsible for better  
20 managing these P3 relationships, these  
21 public private partnerships.

22 If you look at the relationship  
23 that we have with the county with this  
24 contract, you know, there are a number  
25 of issues that could have been

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 prevented. The fact that we're talking  
3 about the cut for the FLEXI route today  
4 when it was just revealed in October  
5 shows a lack of foresight and long term  
6 planning. There has to be someone or  
7 some office responsible for making sure  
8 that these P3 relationships are related.

9 Again, I thank you for this  
10 opportunity and thank you for indulging  
11 me. Thank you.

12 MR. SHRENKEL: Thank you,  
13 Legislator, for your comments and for  
14 being with us today.

15 MR. SOLAGES: Thank you.

16 MR. SHRENKEL: There's one more  
17 person. I didn't see your hand up.

18 MR. YEUNG: So the beginning of  
19 this speech going to be about our  
20 county executive. Not mine because I  
21 live in Queens, but for the Nassau  
22 County residents, my name is Gary  
23 Yeung, G-A-R-Y, Y-E-U-N-G. I live in  
24 Queens.

25 The reason why I'm here fighting

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 for Nassau County's bus system is  
3 because I use it very often to come to  
4 Nassau County to shop, to do medical  
5 things, because Nassau County has much  
6 better facilities.

7 The first part is about County  
8 Executive Mangano, which proves that he  
9 refuses to fund the bus systems. Why  
10 is it that always the poor systems get  
11 defunded, such as the youth program,  
12 the bus system? Why don't we raise the  
13 tax on the rich? Why is it never the  
14 rich?

15 We have a lot of rich people in  
16 Nassau County. They can afford to pay  
17 a few dollars more so we don't get  
18 stranded here, but that's not happening  
19 because Ed Mangano does not care. He  
20 only care about his own political  
21 campaign. He's like we should hold  
22 onto the property tax. What's the  
23 point of holding onto a property tax  
24 if you're going to cut all the services?  
25 What's the point for paying taxes in

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 the first place?

3 Now, I know all of this is not  
4 NICE Bus's fault; however, there are  
5 some things that are NICE Bus fault.  
6 First, the public hearings. NICE Bus  
7 decided to post the public hearings  
8 online two days before the actual  
9 hearing. MTA post them like a month  
10 ago. That is unacceptable because  
11 people may not actually see that  
12 there's a public hearing going on;  
13 therefore, hindering their  
14 participation in the bus system.

15 The second thing is NICE Bus  
16 received approximately \$3 million or so  
17 back in 2016, and instead of using it  
18 to fix the buses which are breaking  
19 down left and right, NICE Bus decide to  
20 buy minibuses and create new routes  
21 that they just cut, and guess what, now  
22 they're cutting again. That is torture  
23 for Nassau County residents because  
24 they lost their job on January 15 of  
25 2016, and then they found new job when

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 NICE Bus cut their bus back, and guess  
3 what now, they lost their job again.  
4 That is not good for the residents. I  
5 don't think that is acceptable to  
6 anyone.

7 If NICE Bus is going to cut the  
8 bus system, leave it cut until NICE Bus  
9 gets stable funding. We should spend  
10 surplus money on maintenance. Bus  
11 reliability is a major problem in  
12 Nassau County. The buses are not  
13 reliable.

14 I was about to get here on a bus,  
15 but unfortunately, I'm going to be late  
16 if I get here on a bus, so I took the  
17 train here. We need to fix the buses  
18 and we need to clean the buses, and  
19 also, for most, I recommend Ed Mangano  
20 get rid of his car; therefore, he can  
21 take the bus all day long, and guess  
22 what, maybe the N81 will come back  
23 because he live in Bethpage.

24 Thank you. Have a good night.

25 MR. ALEXANDER: Eric Alexander.



1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 I'm the director of Vision Long  
3 Island -- well, actually, Northport,  
4 and I did not take the bus here. We do  
5 represent downtown organizations,  
6 chamber of commerce and other groups,  
7 and we want to see infrastructure built  
8 up in our different downtowns.

9 We clearly don't want to see the  
10 buses cut in Nassau County. In fact,  
11 for the last ten years, we've been  
12 lobbying for more bus funds on the  
13 state, and to a certain degree, on  
14 county level.

15 We want to stop the cuts, and  
16 three ways to do that in whatever way  
17 possible. Number one would be to  
18 really make sure there's more tax  
19 revenue out of the county, more county  
20 contribution in the current budget to  
21 support the exiting routes, and they  
22 should do that quite frankly because  
23 New York State has given Nassau County  
24 a significant contribution for many  
25 years much of which many people in this

1           12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2           room have lobbied for and state  
3           senators have gone to bat for, and  
4           certainly compared to Suffolk County.  
5           So you don't want to see that  
6           contribution reduced in any way  
7           possible. So that's the first piece.  
8           The county needs to do its fair share.

9           The MTA payroll taxes are really  
10          bleeding Long Island dry with minimal  
11          services coming back. So there is  
12          legislation. Mark Seramos had a bill  
13          in play last session. We think Mark is  
14          leaving.

15          There will be other folks stepping  
16          up to carry that bill forward, but that  
17          can bring revenue to Nassau County, and  
18          certainly also, Suffolk County. We  
19          need everyone to rally around those  
20          dollars. Long term, smaller fleets and  
21          on demand service. I think there is  
22          very creative proposals that have come  
23          forth from NICE Bus that can really  
24          deal with some of those low ridership  
25          routes.

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 So again, I'll just wrap. This is  
3 not new. It goes back to the Suozzi  
4 administration as far as playing  
5 politics on bus service. That, again,  
6 folks rallied to kind of stop that.  
7 The MTA is out, NICE is in, but the  
8 county has to step up.

9 There are other things in the  
10 budget that, you know, Legislator  
11 Solages has layed out. There may be  
12 some efficiencies and some things that  
13 can be cut. I think if you can't put  
14 those dollars back in this budget, we  
15 need to look at the budget, see where  
16 you can pare down.

17 Of all the things government does,  
18 of all the things government does,  
19 people do not complain about tangible  
20 service like the bus that gets people  
21 to work, gets people to health  
22 services, gets people to their classes  
23 in many cases, community college.

24 Also, the other piece of it is  
25 buses are an essential economic growth

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 vehicle for our various downtowns. We  
3 have the IDA, which we support a lot of  
4 IDA grants that are providing tax  
5 relief to developments in downtown and  
6 jobs in downtowns. They're growing our  
7 downtowns. We need bus service.  
8 Nassau County needs it. Bus service,  
9 you need the transit piece, not just  
10 rail, bus service.

11 So we're glad to see NICE Bus  
12 here, and we certainly recognize their  
13 needs to be revenue to make these  
14 fleets moving and keep the bus service  
15 running. The county has got to step up  
16 and certainly the state dollars need to  
17 be maintained and we got to get our MTA  
18 payroll tax money back, but there's  
19 things we can do.

20 I think there's a lot of folks out  
21 tonight. There could be much more, and  
22 hopefully we're all out on the 14th to  
23 keep the pressure on. I'm glad to see  
24 the media here. I'm glad to see you  
25 guys paying attention. Thank you.

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 MR. SHRENKEL: Thank you. Some of  
3 my own comments. It's been a long day.  
4 We've heard some very interesting  
5 public comments.

6 I don't think there is anyone on  
7 this committee who really wants to see  
8 one bus out of service irrespective of  
9 the fact that there's high supplements  
10 given by the tax payers for those buses  
11 that have very low ridership.

12 We also certainly don't want to  
13 see anyone who has a doctor's  
14 appointment and can't make it, and we  
15 want to see everyone get to work.  
16 However, sitting on this committee and  
17 being on this committee over five  
18 years, and seeing this again from last  
19 year where I was sad to leave one day  
20 when we had the service cuts and  
21 extremely happy to know that some money  
22 came through and it was a temporary  
23 suspension; however, it did cause havoc  
24 and we did get some money, and people  
25 walked away a lot happier than they did

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 last December.

3 As I understand it, however, and  
4 one of the responsibilities of this  
5 committee, and thinking forwardly, NICE  
6 has to have a balanced budget in order  
7 to get the STOA money, and the county  
8 is responsible for putting a minimum  
9 contribution of approximately  
10 \$2.6 million. Those are two musts.

11 When you're facing these  
12 difficulties and you know what funding  
13 problems lay ahead, and you sort of have  
14 this as call it a pre-meeting prior to  
15 the April budget, and the thing which  
16 Mr. Setzer said, if you don't act now  
17 and you don't get the money, you dig  
18 yourself a deeper hole, and then we  
19 come back here in April and you have  
20 more cuts than proposed now. That is  
21 very serious. Today is very serious.

22 If we don't go ahead and we don't  
23 have a balanced budget, we don't have a  
24 bus company. So these are the thoughts  
25 that are in my mind.

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   Mr. Setzer, if you may, I would  
3                   like to give you the opportunity to  
4                   reiterate after hearing two public  
5                   hearings, making your own presentation  
6                   two times, given my comments, and have  
7                   I missed anything as far as the failures  
8                   of, you know, the consequence of  
9                   digging this deep hole?

10                  Before I close and put forth  
11                  motions or resolutions, there was some  
12                  recommendations today, and Legislator,  
13                  I'm glad you're here. Legislator  
14                  Curran said there are fund balances,  
15                  but NIFA won't let anyone touch that  
16                  money. I don't know their reasoning, I  
17                  don't know what's in the fund balances.  
18                  There's a lot of areas of proposed  
19                  service cuts.

20                  We all know that Nassau County is  
21                  facing deep budget cuts. Their budget  
22                  was turned back to them. They reduced  
23                  the proposal on their parking tickets.  
24                  Youth services could be cut, bus  
25                  services could be cut. Right now, our

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 job is bus services.

3 So number one, there is a  
4 legislative meeting coming up. It's up  
5 to you to have those people talk to  
6 whomever they can talk to, whether they  
7 got the contacts up in Albany which was  
8 said before. Go do it! That's our  
9 biggest source of money, and the fact  
10 that we haven't seen an increase down  
11 here, and we pay taxes up there too.

12 So I would like to see some more  
13 STOA money. I would like to see county  
14 money if it's there, and if there's  
15 fund balances, I didn't get the reason  
16 why those fund balances are sitting  
17 there. This is a rainy day.

18 Apparently now, this is now in  
19 NIFA's hands. It's not our job to  
20 lobby, none of the committee members,  
21 but everybody who came here today, and  
22 mentally and -- we're on your side, but  
23 you have to understand the difficulty  
24 we're faced with, with this balanced  
25 budget situation and what has to be



1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 done.

3 If this contract slams away and we  
4 dig ourselves a deeper hole, we're  
5 making a bad situation, a very bad  
6 situation today, could be devastating  
7 in April.

8 Mr. Setzer, see what you could  
9 pick up from the comments that you  
10 thought were salient that you can  
11 address, ideas that you have for this  
12 money, cuts on your end and whatever  
13 you can do. Thank you.

14 MR. MENDEL: Excuse me. You have  
15 millions of dollars in advertising --

16 MR. SHRENKEL: I'm sorry, sir.  
17 Excuse me. This is not a conversation.  
18 This is a public hearing with rules.

19 MR. MENDEL: I understand. Why  
20 not take my advise and do better  
21 advertising on the sides of buses, cut  
22 better deals for people?

23 MR. SHRENKEL: Thank you very  
24 much. We've discussed that for years  
25 already.

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 MR. MENDEL: I know you discussed  
3 for years, and you know what --

4 MR. SHRENKEL: Sir, I'm asking you  
5 to sit down, please. I'm seriously  
6 asking you to sit down.

7 Mr. Setzer, I'm sorry you had this  
8 interruption. This committee has been  
9 here a long time. I would like to hear  
10 what you have to say.

11 MR. SETZER: Mr. Chairman, you  
12 were very eloquent and very complete in  
13 your summary.

14 Couple of very quick points here.  
15 I think what we heard -- most of what  
16 we heard this evening and this  
17 afternoon, we probably mostly all agree  
18 with that bus service and paratransit  
19 service is critical to individuals.

20 It's also critical to communities  
21 like Elmont, and as Mr. Alexander just  
22 pointed out, it's also critical to the  
23 future, the Nassau County of the future  
24 that we all want. Transit oriented  
25 development and good transit service

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   makes it an attractive place, that's  
3                   important to all of us.

4                   Unfortunately, you and I are  
5                   presented with the unhappy  
6                   responsibility of figuring out what do  
7                   we do right now with the resources that  
8                   are actually available to us in the  
9                   present, and that's not an easy choice.  
10                  We've made some recommendations, but  
11                  before I reiterate those, I want to  
12                  take up from something Mr. Alexander  
13                  said.

14                 He talked about the MTA payroll  
15                 tax as a potential source that, I  
16                 think, Nassau Countians pay it, but get  
17                 less of it back. We get it back in the  
18                 form of the Long Island Railroad  
19                 operations, but maybe that's a source  
20                 for the future.

21                 The value of a source like that is  
22                 it that it's dedicated to transit, so  
23                 it doesn't end up being diverted to  
24                 public safety or something else  
25                 important, it's got some built in

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 growth. As the economy improves,  
3 payrolls grow, so payroll taxes grow,  
4 and it's predictable.

5 So instead of being here in  
6 December just knowing that we've got a  
7 \$6.8 million reduction in funding, it's  
8 somewhat predictable. You can forecast  
9 it and you can get some benefit out of  
10 that which makes for better planning.  
11 I am in complete agreement with  
12 everybody who says its crazy to cut  
13 service, add it and cut it again.  
14 Totally agree with that.

15 The real solution long term is to  
16 find dedicated, predictable funding  
17 sources that have the ability to keep  
18 up with the growth and expense so that  
19 we can create something that really  
20 works for Nassau County.

21 Just to reiterate, my  
22 recommendation is still that the most  
23 prudent course of action is to make  
24 those January cuts and then continue to  
25 work with funding sources and everyone

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 else to see if we can head off all or  
3 most of those April cuts. Thank you.

4 MR. SHRENKEL: I would like the  
5 committee to acknowledge that we've  
6 received the public comments and that a  
7 forum was conducted and reviewed by  
8 this committee. The first thing, can  
9 we please all acknowledge that we've  
10 been here and we received public  
11 comments and we've conducted this forum  
12 as a committee, just with a show of  
13 hands. Please record the record as a  
14 unanimous vote.

15 Would any member move to adopt a  
16 resolution of receiving the service  
17 equity analysis?

18 MS. FALCO: So received.

19 MR. SHRENKEL: Someone second  
20 that. Thank you.

21 Everyone agrees, say aye.

22 COUNCIL MEMBERS: "Aye."

23 MR. SHRENKEL: Let the record  
24 reflect all the members stated that.

25 I would like to make a motion for

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION  
2                   a resolution regarding NICE service  
3                   structure and proposal in the January  
4                   eliminations. So I would like to ask a  
5                   member to make a motion for that.

6                   With that, Counsel, would you mind  
7                   calling a roll and taking the vote of  
8                   the members as far as the proposal for  
9                   the January eliminations of bus routes.

10                  MR. LITTMAN: Just so everyone is  
11                  clear and we're on the same page, we're  
12                  only talking about the January proposed  
13                  eliminations specifically, the Elmont  
14                  FLEXI, the Mercy shuttle, the Rockville  
15                  shuttle, the Freeport shuttle, the  
16                  Hicksville/Wantagh shuttle, the N51,  
17                  the N80/81, the N6X and the N48, those  
18                  nine lines and those nine lines only,  
19                  and I'm going to call for everyone's  
20                  vote.

21                  Mr. Watkins-Lopez.

22                  MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: I'm just going  
23                  to make a comment first.

24                  First of all, as a bus rider, I'm  
25                  also a tax payer. I subsidize these

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 buses just as much as every other tax  
3 payer in Nassau County, so does every  
4 other bus rider in this room, and to  
5 make the distinction that bus riders  
6 are not subsidizing themselves, which  
7 means they are subsidizing for these  
8 low ridership routes on top of the  
9 fares that they pay is disrespectful,  
10 and I've said this before and I'll say  
11 it again.

12 Secondly, for the last five years,  
13 this has been the situation. NICE Bus  
14 has been unable to balance their budget  
15 and I cannot in good faith that for the  
16 next five years you're going to be able  
17 to. I vote no.

18 MR. SHRENKEL: Mr. Berse.

19 MR. BERSE: As I said earlier, I  
20 am extremely uncomfortable with these  
21 proposed cuts given the circumstances  
22 of what happened last year, and when  
23 they were originally proposed that we  
24 cut, I approached it as a business  
25 decision, not figuring on what

1                   12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2                   happened, that we did get money in the  
3                   11th hour and other people were able to  
4                   pull funds from other places to help  
5                   restore service.

6                   I don't think things had enough  
7                   time to grow and decide where they're  
8                   going. Eric Alexander's comments that  
9                   started touching on transit oriented  
10                  development and the future of what's  
11                  going to happen in some communities in  
12                  downtowns where they're expecting  
13                  people to move in who are not going to  
14                  be car people, but they're going to be  
15                  professionals that they're going to  
16                  need to get to the trains, so they will  
17                  need a bus to go to and from the train  
18                  or do any other shopping or any other  
19                  things like that, that the future is  
20                  that the buses have to survive. The  
21                  buses need to be subsidized.

22                  At this time, given what happened  
23                  last year, fool me once, shame on you,  
24                  fool me twice, shame on me. At this  
25                  time, I cannot in clear conscious vote



1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 yes, so I vote no.

3 MR. LITTMAN: Ms. Falco.

4 MS. FALCO: As a daily rider of  
5 public transportation, it is with a  
6 heavy heart that I vote yes. There is  
7 just -- the funds are not here. We do  
8 not have the funds.

9 MR. LITTMAN: Mr. Shrenkel.

10 MR. SHRENKEL: I think I've stated  
11 my comments before. It's tremendous  
12 regret in my vote, but I have to vote  
13 yes, and I cannot let this situation  
14 get worse than it is.

15 MR. LITTMAN: Mr. Duroseau.

16 MR. DUROSEAU: I also stated  
17 before there are a lot of money out  
18 there. Look for them. Talking about  
19 over \$12 million; therefore, I vote no.

20 MR. LITTMAN: Mr. Rosario.

21 MR. ROSARIO: It's also a heavy  
22 heart for myself and I feel for you,  
23 and I seen personally the ridership  
24 that's out there, but I also agree with  
25 our Chairman, that this game has got to

1 12/08/16 - EVENING SESSION

2 stop. The money is out there.

3 We are, the committee members, are  
4 put in a position and you the ridership  
5 swear that we're ones that's holding  
6 back and that decide whether the money  
7 is given or not.

8 It is not in our power, and I have  
9 to decide yes, but I wish that the  
10 money would stop playing this game with  
11 the budgets every year that we're  
12 playing with the ridership, but I vote  
13 yes.

14 MR. LITTMAN: We have three yes  
15 votes and three no notes, so the  
16 resolution fails. There will be no  
17 January cuts.

18 MR. SHRENKEL: At this time we  
19 would like to make a motion to adjourn  
20 our meeting.

21 Meeting is adjourned.

22 (Whereupon, the Nassau County Bus  
23 Transit Committee meeting was concluded  
24 at 8:00 P.M.)

25 \* \* \* \*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

STATE OF NEW YORK )

: SS.:

COUNTY OF SUFFOLK )

I, ALEX TURTEL, a Notary Public for and within the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the minutes of the Nassau County Bus Transit Committee meeting are a true and accurate record of the stenographic notes taken by me therein.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 28th day of December, 2016.

*Alex Turtel*

ALEX TURTEL

